



Landmarks & Urban
Conservation Commission



Agenda Number: 4
Case No.: SI-2018-00070
Project # PR-2018-001335
AUGUST 8, 2018

Staff Report

Agent	Stephen Leos
Applicant	Assistance League of Albuquerque
Request	Certificate of Appropriateness for reconstruction
Legal Description	Lot 209, Block 0000
Address/Location	2107 Church Street NW
Size	0.08 ac.
Zoning	MX-T
Historic Location	Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone

Staff Recommendation

APPROVAL of Case # SI-2018-00070, Project # PR-2018-001335, a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for reconstruction based on the Findings beginning on page 9 and subject to the Condition of Approval on page 10.

Angela Behrens
Historic Preservation Planner

Summary of Analysis

The application is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace a modern addition to the rear of an adobe/terrone house, originally constructed circa 1880.

The replacement structure is of similar form and footprint to the existing addition and it includes an accessible bathroom, a kitchenette and supplementary retail space.

This request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a replacement addition has been reviewed against the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone Development Guidelines and the criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness contained in the LUC Ordinance. The applicant's proposal complies with the development guidelines and is eligible for a Certificate of Appropriateness.

PRIMARY REFERENCES:

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance; Design Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone.

Development Review Division Report:

SUMMARY OF REQUEST

<i>Requests</i>	<i>Certificate of Appropriateness for construction of a replacement addition</i>
<i>Historic Location</i>	<i>Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone</i>

AREA HISTORY AND CHARACTER

Surrounding architectural styles, historic character and recent (re)development

	<i># of Stories</i>	<i>Roof Configuration, Architectural Style and Approximate Age of Construction</i>	<i>Historic Classification & Land Use</i>
<i>General Area</i>	1-2	Flat; Pitched (gabled and hipped), New Mexico Vernacular, Spanish-Pueblo Revival and contemporary interpretations; Territorial Revival, Brick Commercial, 1796 – 1990's.	Contributing, Neutral, Unclassified; Residential and Commercial
<i>Site to the North</i>	1	New Mexico Vernacular, gabled roof, rendered.	Neutral
<i>Site to the South</i>		Parking lot behind adobe boundary wall	Non-classified
<i>Site to the East</i>	2	New Mexico Vernacular, flat roof with corner parapet, portals. Rendered.	Contributing
<i>Site to the West</i>	1	New Mexico Vernacular, flat roof with stepped parapet, portal. Adobe.	Contributing

II. INTRODUCTION

Proposal

The request is for a Certificate of Appropriateness to replace the accretion of modern block additions which wrap around the north-east corner of the circa 1880 building and connect with a further modern addition to the north. The existing additions are of no architectural or historic interest and structurally unsound.

The replacement addition provides an accessible bathroom, kitchenette and supplementary retail space, all of which facilitate the current sustainable and appropriate use of the historic building.

The replacement structure is similar in proportion and massing to the existing addition and of simple, neutral design. It has concrete footings, wood frame walls and a flat roof covered with TPO roofing membrane. The western edge of the roof is concealed behind a parapet and the roof overhang on the eastern side has a gutter and down-spout. The walls are stuccoed to match the

historic building. There are four new wood framed windows: the western elevation has a single hung sash, and the eastern elevation has a single hung sash plus two fixed pane windows.

Existing unsightly, surface mounted conduits are removed from the exterior of the historic building and the external components of new HVAC system will not be visible from the street.

Context

The Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone encompasses an area roughly between Mountain Road and Central Ave. on the north and south, and Rio Grande Blvd. and the 19th St. on the west and east. The historic zone was created with the adoption of the City's first zoning Code in 1959 to preserve and promote the educational, cultural and general welfare of the public through the preservation of protection of the traditional architectural character of historic old Albuquerque.

The Spanish Colonial, Territorial or Western Victorian architectural styles of buildings and structures erected prior to 1912 in the area now constituted as the State of New Mexico, comprise the traditional architectural character of the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone (MX-T)

Inside this historic zone is the state registered "Old Albuquerque Historic District". The Old Albuquerque Historic District is a sub-set of the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone. The historic district is the core of the Hispano village of Albuquerque, founded in 1706, and the main village in the area until the arrival of the railroad in 1880. The church and plaza are at the center of the district, as in most Hispanic villages of New Mexico.

Of the buildings in the district, only San Felipe de Neri church can be shown to date to the Spanish Colonial period. A few buildings may be in whole or in part from the early nineteenth century, but the majority of the buildings in Old Albuquerque Historic District were built between 1870 and 1900.

Almost every building has seen some degree of remodeling, resulting from the area's growth as a tourist-oriented commercial center after 1940. Old Albuquerque became "Old Town", a district of shops, boutiques, galleries and restaurants. Many buildings acquired Pueblo Revival portals, protruding false vigas and other stylistic elements thought to be conducive to a tourist atmosphere.

History

The New Mexico Vernacular style building was constructed circa 1880 as a single family residence and it is now in retail use.

It is a modest, little altered, single storey structure of terrone, with an earthen roof supported on wood beams. A portal with replacement posts extends across the full width of the southern (front) elevation. The building has 2 over 2 double hung sash windows at the front, with a combination of wood and metal casements to the sides and rear.

An accretion of modern, block additions wrap around the north-east corner of the historic building and connect with a further modern addition to the north.

The principal building makes an important contribution to the locally distinctive qualities of the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone. However the modern additions to the rear are of no architectural or historic interest.

APPLICABLE PLANS, ORDINANCES, DESIGN GUIDELINES & POLICIES

III. ANALYSIS

Policies are written in regular text and staff analysis and comment in bold italic print.

Comprehensive Zoning Code/ Integrated Development Ordinance

The Old Town Historic Zone was designated in 1959 with the adoption of the first Zoning Code for the City of Albuquerque. Old Town was recognized even then as a very special location within Albuquerque, and the H-1 Zone was designated specifically to address the development within Old Town.

In 2018, the Old Town Historic Zone became the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone and it was expanded to include a primarily residential area to the south-east. The block was developed in the early 20th century and it is bounded by Old Town Road and Lomas Blvd to the north and south, and San Pasquale Ave. and 19th Street to the west and east. The zoning district classification was changed from H-1 to MX-T. Signage, architectural style and permissive uses are controlled through the MX-T Zoning. The code provides for Certificates of Appropriateness for development within the MX-T zone and relevant sections (§14-16-2-25, R.O.A., 1994) are attached.

Any construction, alteration or demolition, which would affect the exterior appearance of any structure within the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone shall not be undertaken until the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission has approved a Certificate of Appropriateness. The Code also provides that the adopted specific development guidelines may provide exemptions to the requirement or provide for City staff approval in lieu of Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission approval. Procedures relating to the issuance of a Certificate of Appropriateness are prescribed in Chapter 14, Article 12, Landmarks and Urban Conservation.

An analysis of the proposal's conformance with the adopted specific development guidelines is provided below.

Development Guidelines for the Old Town Historic Zone

Design Guidelines (as amended through April 9, 1998) have been adopted by the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission for building projects in the MX-T Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone. The Guidelines are general, and along with standards applicable to the rehabilitation of historic properties, they address contemporary new buildings and pedestrian safety.

1. Every reasonable effort should be made to provide a compatible use for buildings which will require minimum alteration to the building and its environment.

The proposal requires no alteration to the historic building and the replacement addition will be in compatible use. It will provide an accessible bathroom, kitchenette and additional retail space, all of which facilitate the current sustainable and appropriate use of the historic building.

2. Rehabilitation work should not destroy the distinguishing qualities or character of the property and its environment. The removal or alteration of any historic material or architectural features should be held to the minimum, consistent with the proposed use.

The distinctive character and the original fabric of the historic building are unaffected by the proposal, which replaces a modern rear addition.

3. Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, wherever possible. In the event replacement is necessary, the new material should match the material being replaced in composition, design, color, texture, and other visual qualities. Repair or replacement of missing architectural features should be based on accurate duplications of original features, substantiated by physical or pictorial evidence rather than on conjectural designs of the availability of different architectural features from other buildings.

The existing modern addition is of no architectural or historic interest and it is structurally unsound. The replacement addition is similar in proportion and massing to the existing structure and of simple, neutral design. It has a compatible roof form, the walls are stuccoed to match the historic building and the new wood-framed windows complement the existing fenestration.

4. Distinctive stylistic features or examples of skilled craftsmanship which characterize older structure and often predate the mass production of building materials should be treated with sensitivity.

Not Applicable

5. Many changes to buildings and environments which have taken place in the course of time are evidence of the history of the building and the neighborhood. These changes may have developed significance in their own right, and this significance should be recognized and respected.

The accretion of modern, poor quality block additions to the rear of the principal building are of no architectural or historic interest. They make no contribution to the significance of the historic building to which they are attached, or to the locally distinctive qualities of the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone.

6. All buildings should be recognized as products of their own time. Alterations to create an appearance inconsistent with the actual character of the building should be discouraged.

The replacement addition is of simple, neutral design and good quality, durable modern materials. While the stucco finish of the new walls will match that of the historic building, the new structure is clearly contemporary no attempt is made to assume a misleading historic appearance.

7. The design and general appearance of any development or alteration in the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone should be limited to the range of design options possible and commonly chosen in Albuquerque prior to the opening of the Santa Fe Railroad in April 1880. The design of any alteration to currently existing structures erected between 1880 and 1912 should be limited to the range of design options possible and commonly chosen at the time of the building's construction.

The proposed addition replaces an existing modern addition. It is similar in proportion and massing to the existing structure and of simple, neutral design. The new work is of similar design and form to many contemporary additions to buildings in the Old Town Historic Preservation overlay Zone and no attempt is made to assume a misleading historic appearance.

9. Wherever possible, new additions or alterations to buildings should be done in such a manner that if they were to be removed in the future, the essential form and integrity of the original building would be unimpaired.

The proposed addition replaces an accretion of modern, block additions which wrap around the north-east corner of the historic building and connect with a further modern addition to the north. The current proposal has no impact on the historic fabric of the 1880 house and the new structure could be fully removed, leaving the essential form and integrity of the original building unimpaired.

10. Every effort should be made to safeguard the public welfare along vehicular and pedestrian traffic ways. Placement of walls, building projections, fences, planters, shrubs, signs, ramps, steps, etc. should be planned and positioned so that they do not present a potential hazard. Provisions for the handicapped should be planned so that the essential character of the property is not damaged.

Construction work is confined to the rear of the property and poses no danger to public welfare. The replacement addition includes an accessible bathroom which makes good provision for handicapped users of the building.

11. Any security device that prevents major features of doors and windows such as ornament, panels, glass panes, and mullions from being seen are prohibited.

Not Applicable

12. Property owners are considering installing security devices are urged to contact LUCC staff for advice and a free handout on how to increase security without detracting from the historic character of a building.

Not Applicable

13. An application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for work which does not require any type of building or construction permit may be approved by staff.

The current application for a Certificate of Appropriateness is submitted to the LUCC for review because it involves demolition and substantial reconstruction. For the reasons set out in this report, Staff considers the proposal to cause no harm to the significance of the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone and recommends approval.

Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance

This site consists of a contributing property in the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone and the project is subject to certain provisions of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance (Article 12, R.O.A., 1994). The purpose of this ordinance is to:

“Preserve, protect, enhance, perpetuate and promote the use of structures and areas of historical, cultural, architectural, engineering, archeological or geographic significance located in the city; to strengthen the city’s economic base by stimulating the tourist industry; to enhance the identity of the city by protecting the city’s heritage and prohibiting the unnecessary destruction or defacement of its cultural assets; and to conserve existing urban developments as viable economic and social entities.”

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides that:

"Within the boundaries of a historic zone, urban conservation overlay zone, or landmark site, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved."

Section 14-12-8 (A) of the LUC ordinance provides criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness:

§14-12-8-B- (1) The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the historic overlay zone.

As discussed in the analysis above, the development is consistent with the ordinance and the development guidelines.

§14-12-8 (B) (2) The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished.

The architectural character of the site and the historic zone will not be significantly impaired or diminished by the new development. The proposed addition replaces an existing modern addition. It is similar in proportion and massing to the existing structure and of simple, neutral design. The new work is of comparable design and form to many contemporary additions to buildings in the Old Town Historic Preservation overlay Zone.

§14-12-8 (B) (3) The change qualified as a “certified rehabilitation: pursuant to the Tax Reform Act of 1976.

Not applicable

§14-12-8 (B) (4) The structure or site’s distinguished original qualities or character will not be altered. Original shall mean at the time of initial construction or developed over the course of history of the structure.

The design and scale of the new structure are compatible with the surroundings and no alteration is made to the original 1880 building.

§14-12-8 (B) (5) Deteriorated architectural features should be repaired rather than replaced, if possible. If replacement is necessary, the new material shall match the original as closely as possible in like material and design.

The existing modern addition is of no architectural or historic interest and it is structurally unsound. The replacement addition is similar in proportion and massing to the existing structure and of simple, neutral design. It has a compatible roof form, the walls are stuccoed to match the historic building and the new wood-framed windows complement the existing fenestration.

§14-12-8 (B) (6) Additions to existing structure and new construction may be of contemporary design if such design is compatible with the historic zone in which it is to be located.

The replacement addition is similar in proportion and massing to the existing structure and of simple, neutral design. It is compatible with the New Mexico Vernacular style of the original house and appropriate to the local context.

§14-12-8 (B) (7) Demolition shall only be permitted if it is determined that the property is incapable of producing a reasonable economic return as presently controlled and that no means of preserving the structure has been found. In making a determination regarding reasonable economic return the Commission may consider the estimated market value of the building, land and any proposed replacement structures, financial details of the property including, but not limited to income and expense statements, current mortgage balances and appraisals, the length of time that the property has been on the market for sale or lease, potential return based on projected future market conditions, the building's structural condition, and other items determined to be relevant to the application.

Not applicable.

V. Neighborhood/Public Concerns

The application was legally advertised in the newspaper. A sign was posted on the property with notice of the application and hearing date. The applicant notified the Historic Old Town Property Owners Association of the request. To date, no comments have been received regarding this application.

Conclusions

This request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a replacement rear addition has been reviewed against the *Old Town Historic Zone Development Guidelines* and the criteria for approval of a Certificate of Appropriateness contained in the *LUC Ordinance*. The proposed rear addition complies with both.

FINDINGS for APPROVAL of a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a replacement addition, Case # SI-2018-00070 / Project # PR-2018-001335.
August 8, 2018.

1. This application is a request for a Certificate of Appropriateness for the property described as Lot 209 of the Old Albuquerque Town site, MRGCD Map 38, in the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone (MX-T).
2. The subject property is approximately 0.08 acres and contains an existing building of 1880 which makes an important contribution to the significance of the Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone (MX-T)
3. The proposal is to replace an accretion of modern, block additions which wrap around the north-east corner of the historic building and connect with a further modern addition to the north. The existing additions are of no architectural or historic interest and structurally unsound.

The replacement addition provides an accessible bathroom, kitchenette and supplementary retail space, all of which facilitate the current sustainable and appropriate use of the historic building.

The replacement addition is similar in proportion and massing to the existing structure and of simple, neutral design. It has concrete footings, wood frame walls and a flat roof covered with TPO roofing membrane. The western edge of the roof is concealed behind a parapet and the roof overhang on the eastern side has a gutter and down-spout. The walls are stuccoed to match the historic building. There are four new wood framed windows: the western elevation has a single hung sash, and the eastern elevation has a single hung sash plus two fixed pane windows.

4. Section 14-16-2-25(D)(1) of the Comprehensive Zoning Code states “Any construction, modification, addition, alteration, moving or destruction which would affect the exterior appearance of any structure or place in the MX-T zone requires a Certificate of Appropriateness which must be approved by the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Commission.”
5. Section 14-12-8(A) of the Landmarks and Urban Conservation Ordinance states that within the boundaries of a historic zone, the exterior appearance of any structure shall not be altered, new structures shall not be constructed, and existing structures shall not be demolished until a Certificate of Appropriateness has been duly approved.
6. The LUC Ordinance specifies that an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if it complies with several specified criteria. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(1) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if “*The change is consistent with the designation ordinance and specific development guidelines for the landmark or historic zone*”.

The proposed development is consistent with the designation ordinance and the guidelines.

7. The LUC Ordinance Section 14-12(8)(B)(2) states that a Certificate of Appropriateness shall be approved if “The architectural character, historical value, or archaeological value of the structure or site itself or of any historic zone or urban conservation overlay zone in which it is located will not be significantly impaired or diminished”.

The architectural character of the MX-T Zone will not be impaired or diminished by the proposed addition, which replaces an existing modern addition. It is similar in proportion and massing to the existing structure and of simple, neutral design. The new work is of comparable design and form to many contemporary additions to historic buildings in the MX-T Zone and appropriate to the local context.

RECOMMENDATION

Case # SI-2018-00070 / Project # PR-2018-001335. August 8, 2018.

APPROVAL of an application for a Certificate of Appropriateness for a replacement addition at 2107 Church Street NW, Lot 209, Old Town Historic Preservation Overlay Zone (MX-T), based on the above 7 Findings and subject to the following condition.

Condition of Approval Recommended for Case # SI-2018-00070 / Project # PR-2018-001335

1. Applicant is responsible to acquire, and approval is contingent upon, approval of all applicable permits and related approvals.

Angela Behrens, Historic Preservation Planner
Urban Design and Development Division